

Review

By
Prof. Manol Nikolov Ribov, PhD
Scientific field 3.8. Economics and Management
Department of Tourism Economics, Faculty of Infrastructure Economics
University of National and World Economy

Member of scientific jury for participation in the competition for academic position “associate professor” in the professional direction 3.9. Tourism (Human Capital in Tourism),
declared in the State Gazette no. 93/26.11.2019
with candidate Assistant Professor Milena Metodieva Karailieva

The review was prepared on the basis of **Rector’s Order No.3 RC 118/27.01.2020** and the **Decision of the Scientific Jury of 10.02.2020** for its implementation (RASPRSRB) and the Regulation for the development of academic staff at NBU. In structural terms, it consists of six parts, an introduction and conclusion.

I. Assessment of compliance with the minimum national requirements and requirements of New Bulgarian University

The self-assessment report provided by the candidate shows that it covers the necessary minimum of requirements for the scientific, teaching and research activity for the occupation of the academic position “Associate Professor”, in accordance with PPRASRB.¹

II. Research (creative) activity and results

For participation for an academic position "Associate Professor" in the professional direction 3.9. Tourism Milena Karailieva submitted for consideration the following publications: **4 collective monographs** and **3 individual monographs**, one of them **habilitation work**, **3 articles**, **1 studio**, **16 papers**, five of them in English and **2 textbooks**, one of them electronic for the need of distance education in NBU, or in total 31 publications with a total volume of **1809 pages**.² From all of these presented for review publications accepted for evaluation include: **6 monographs (B-3, D-4 No. 1 and 2, D-10 No. 2, 3 and 4)**, of which (No.4 co-authored); **1 studio (G-9 No.1)**, **16 papers** presented at scientific forums, of which **5 (G-7 No.12, 13 ,14 ,15 and 16) are in English** and **1 textbook (E-20 No.1)**.

Rejected for evaluation publications include: **1 monograph (G-10 № 2)**, **1 textbook (E-21)** и **3 articles**.³ Motives are: the monograph includes materials from dissertation work; the three articles are from popular nature (Journal „Cultural-Informational Guide for Pernik town); the textbook covering some materials in accepted for review textbook.

¹ Minimum requirements for the scientific, teaching and/or creative activity of the candidates for the occupation of the academic positions in professional fields, complying with AAPPB (**groups of indicators A-E**) and the corresponding number of points above the required minimum: **A 50/50, B 100/100, G 510/200, D 125/50 and E 105/0- non-required for associate professor** and fulfillment of criteria and indicators for long-term for announcing a competition for a higher academic position, according to the current MBU ordinance- academic work, organizational work and community service (**groups of indicators G-I): G 410/50,3325/70 I 105/50**.

² Table. 2 Bibliographic description of the supporting material to Annex No.2 “Minimum National Requirements of the NBU to be Applicant for the Academic Degree and the Occupation of the Academic Post” Associate Professor”

³ See List of publications and creative achievements after defending the doctoral thesis 2005-2020

Table 1. Publications presented in qualitative and quantitative terms

Type of publication	Authorship		Language of publications		Number in the list of publications	Number of publications	Number of pages
	Individual	Co-authored	BG	ENG			
Monographs	3	3			(B-3, G-4 №1, 2, G-10 № 2, 3,4)	6	1036
Studios	1		1		(G-9 №1)	1	41
Reports	10	1	11	5	(Г-7 № 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9) (Г-7 № 12, 13, 14, 15, 16)	16	163
Textbooks	1		1		(E-20 №1)	1	343
Total						24	1583

Publications accepted for evaluation include **3 individual monographs**. The candidate's publications were reviewed by habilitated teachers, mainly by MBU, UNWE, Sofia University "St. Kliment Ohridski" and SWU "Neofit Rilski". They have been published in university publishers and at "Avanguard Prima" and have been promoted through the usual channels of book distribution. For co-authored publications, authors' shareholders are noted in the publications themselves.

1. Evaluation of the monographic work concerning the scientific and applied scientific contributions of the author.

For basic habilitation work, the applicant submitted a monograph entitled "**Human Capital in Tourism**". The relevance of this topic is indisputable. It reflects the continuing scientific interest in human capital in all areas of business. This is explained by the mobility of employees and the multiethnic structure of the tourism workforce., the change in centres of power and leadership, multidirectional flexible policies, changes in people's working and social life, talent management, teams and time, measurement and evaluation of the value of human capital.

The monograph was prepared in a volume of **431 pages**, 12 of which are bibliographic apparatus. Structurally, the work consists of an **introduction, four chapters and a conclusion**. They have consistently examined the theoretical framework of human capital, the management of the tourism company and human resources, the approaches, tactics and strategies used to develop these resources.

In **the first chapter** of the monographic work the conceptual and terminological apparatus is clarified. The evolution of the concept of human capital and its role in tourism is examined. The peculiarities of labour in tourism and investment opportunities with view to generating intellectual capital have been clarified. Particular attention is paid to innovation in human capital and formation of intellectual capital. The issues related to the tourism system were also not ignored. And this is understandable having in mind the challenges that human resources in tourism face. Trends in the management and development of human capital have also been identified. The general conclusion drawn by the author is that the change in human behavior in particular social, organizational and work, as well as their presentation, passes through knowledge, competences and skills.

The second chapter deals with the peculiarities of the management and the role of the manager in the tourist company. Particular attention is paid to the management of the processes

in the company, and on this basis the questions for the design and choice of organizational structure in tourism have been developed. The author's views on tourism management and leadership are of interest. In this context, questions about the culture of governance have also been developed. In the final part of this chapter, the topic related to tourism innovation is also elaborated. It is obvious that the dynamic development of tourism requires new ideas, knowledge and concrete research that is impossible without innovation and investment in intellectual capital. Encouraging such investments and professional engagement build sustainable public business and individual behavior that reflect on the competitiveness of the tourist industry.

The third chapter is excellent in its features and it deals with the management of human capital in a tourist company. The author clarifies the issues related to the analysis of tourism jobs, planning the need of new staff, their recruitment and selection. Strategic and operational human capital management, conflict management and team potential are also discussed. Particular attention is paid to the integration of staff into the culture of management and social adaptation. Strategic and operational human capital management, conflict management and team potential are discussed. The main conclusion is that human capital is the focus of all functional activities in modern management concepts. Successful implementation of the work process as expedient activity outcomes at the output such as competitiveness of services, sustainable development and business growth, profits, investments and new markets.

The last fourth chapter focuses on the development of human potential. The issues of tourism motivation and, in particular, material incentives, have been addressed here, with particular attention to the evaluation of tourism staff, their training and career development. Also worthy of note is the original interpretation of such actual issues as limiting staff turnover and retaining talent within the company. Generally speaking, attracting and retaining valuable employees in tourism industry is by providing opportunities for development and performance of human potential and in- depth strategic and wide-ranging management knowledge in the field. Of course large-scale studies of the future development of human capital in no way exhaust the unlimited possibilities in this field.

In general, the applicant's **scientific contributions to the monograph work** are as follows:

1. The conceptual and terminological apparatus of human capital in tourism **has been refined and supplemented.**
2. Based on current trends in the management and development of human resources, identifying features for human potential **have been proposed.**
3. **The peculiarities** of the manifestation of the human capital in general and specific functions of management of the tourist company **are established.**
4. **The strategies and tactics** for the development of the human potential in the policy of the tourist company **have been also developed.**

Practical contributions could be defined as follows:

1. Methodological guidelines **have been defined** which allow the theoretical formulations to be brought to their practical applicability and usability by tourist companies.
2. Procedures for evaluation of staff and their performance **have been prepared.**
3. The motivational potential of spiritual and material incentives for different categories of staff **has been identified.**

Despite the merits of the monograph, in the course of my acquaintance with it, I came across some weaknesses. Without giving them much importance, I will allow myself to make the following **critical remarks:**

1. It would be good to refine the system of criteria and indicators for assessing the quality of the workforce and its performance.

2. It would be helpful if the analysis of the organizational structure of tourist companies would also address issues related to the impact of these structures on labour productivity.

3. Monographic work would be profitable if it also reflected the issues posed by job cuts as a result of the invasion of artificial intelligence in the production of and non- production fields.

These critical remarks do not diminish the importance of the applicant's distinguished scientific achievements. The subject-matter analysis of the monograph shows that, based on the scientific results achieved, solutions are offered for certain applied tasks of human capital management in tourism companies.

2. Evaluation of the contributions in other attached publications

In addition to the main monograph work, the applicant submitted **23 other publications: 5 monographs, 16 reports, 1 study and 1 textbook with a total volume of 1 152 pages**. The analysis for the thematic orientation of these publications gives me the reasons to distinguish them into several groups, vasio-action of the topics included in them ranging from simple exchange of ideas to the mutual integration of concepts, methodologies, procedures, epistemologies, terminology, etc. In particular, these are the following **four groups**:

1. Tourism Resource Potential (G-7 No. 10 and 13, E-20 No. 1)

2. Human Resources in tourism (G-7 No. 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 12, 14, 15 and 16, G-10 No.3 and 4)

3. Balneological, spa and wellness tourist behavior (G-4 No.1, G-7 No.1 and G-9 No. 1)

4. Psychology of tourist behavior (G-7 No.4, 7 and G-4 No. 2 and G-7 No.2)

This systematization of the candidate's work is based on typological features. It emphasizes the thematic similarity between the publications in the respective group. The aim is to cover all the candidate's publications in one set and examine them as a whole system. Further, the logic of analysis leads to the decomposition of this set of groups and the establishment of systematic links between them.

The first of the four thematic areas reflects the resource potential in tourism (G-7 No.13, G-10 No.2 No.13, E-20 No. 1 and G-7 No. 4, 7 and 9). Publications in this area address the issues of natural and anthropogenic tourism resources, as well as the regional tourism resource availability of tourism in Bulgaria.

The second thematic area deals with the **topic of human resources in tourism**, their information, organization and management in the conditions of the digital transformation of the workforce in tourism (**B-3 No.1, G-7 No. 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 12, 14, 15 and 16, G-10 No. 3 and 4**)

The third thematic area deals with the **issues of balneology, spa and wellness tourism (G-4 No.1, G-7 No.1 and G-9 No.1).** The publications in this area address the issues of the nature and content of balneo, spa and wellness tourism and the management of its quality and competitiveness, the organization of these types of tourism, trends in supply and demand, problems and prospects in their development.

The fourth strand interprets the **socio-psychological aspects of motivation** in tourism (**G-No.2 and G-7 No.2**).

The applicant's scientific contributions to the publications of the four groups discussed are the result of the applicant's results achieved to solve certain practical problems. The attempt to fresh out this relatively general finding leads to various more or less substantiated conditions with character conditions, which are formed into the following four groups:

The applicant's scientific contributions to the publications of the four groups are the result of the applicant's reproductive activity, in which and through scientific results are achieved to

solve certain practical problems. The attempt to fresh out relatively general finding leads to various more or less substantiated conclusions with character contributions, which are formed into the following **four groups**:

1. An instrument for assessing tourism resource availability in Bulgaria **is proposed**.
2. Guidelines **have been formulated** and recommendations have been made to improve the management of human resources in tourism.
3. Common and lasting trends in the development of balneological, spa and wellness tourism **have been identified**.
4. The factors and mechanisms that determine the tourist behavior **are described**.

3. Citation of the candidate by other authors

From the information provided by the NBU Information Centre: "Citation Analysis CA-17-2019" of 27.06.2019, it was found that the candidate was cited by 12 other authors (**G-12**)

4. Evaluation of the results of the participation in research and creative projects and application of the obtained results in practice.

The applicant has participated in **three** projects under the Operational Programme "Human Resources Development" as an expert. The first of these projects concerns the updating of higher education curricula. The second project addresses the issues of developing e- learning. As for the third one, it is dedicated to student practices (**E-16 No. 1-3**).⁴

III. Lecturing and teaching activities

1. Auditory and extracurricular work, work in the electronic training module "MOODLE- NBU", provision of student placements and internships, work with students and doctoral students.

The applicant gives lectures to students of professional direction 3.9. Tourism at the Bachelor's and Master's Degree Programs at NBU. Her lectures are in the following disciplines: tourism resources, tourism management, management and development of human potential in tourism, human resources management, psychology of tourism, reengineering of business processes in tourism. The teaching activity of the applicant is distinguished by the use of interactive training tools. It is evident from the provided long-term assessment certificate that the applicant completed the planned scientific employment activities in accordance with the plans for each semester. She has fulfilled the standard of employment under the Ordinance for employment throughout the period above the required standard (**by category auditorium 240 hours, extra-academic load 60 hours**) as follows: realized workload **2013/2014** 240/420, **2014/2015** 132/545, **2015/2016** 258/545, **2016/2017** 340/510, **2017/2018** 325/746, **2018/2019** 669//440, and during **the current 2019/2020 the applicant's planned employment** is 556/480 hours.

⁴1. Scheme: BG051PO001-3.1.07 „Updating higher education curricular in accordance with the requirements of the labour market”Project BG051PO001-3.1.07-0039 „Higher education in economics – the foundation of the knowledge economy”, Department “Business Administration “NBU, 2013-2015, in the position of Expert for Bachelor's program” “Business Administration” – full-time and distance education.

2. Scheme: BG051PO001-4.3.04 „Development of electronic forms of distance learning in the higher education system”, Project BG051PO001-4.3.04-0037 - C0001 „Improving the quality of distance learning of the Centre for Distance and E- Learning at the New Bulgarian University”, 2013-2015, Author of the NBU multimedia electronic textbook on approved Standard and its annexes;

3 Project BG 051PO001-3.3.07-0002 „Student practices“, NES, 2013-2015, Functional Expert and Academic Mentor

In the period 2009-2019, Milena Karailieva was the scientific **supervisor of 36 students** and she reviewed **92 diploma papers**. In addition, she regularly participates in committees for protection of bachelor's and master's degrees and for state examinations. (**Z-38 No.1-2**). The candidate also actively participates in the practical training of students. As a research supervisor, she has developed internal projects each year at the NBU Curriculum Fund and has organized student internships. (**Z-39 No.1-5**).

2. Student survey questionnaires

Information provided by the Centre for Career Development and Training
Resources at NBU shows that the applicant's grade is high-average for the last 10 semesters (5 years) - Excellent 4.65 from the maximum 5.00. (**Z-35 No.1**)

IV. Administrative and public activity

1. Participation in the collective governing bodies of the NBU

The applicant's long-term assessment report shows she fulfills her academic obligations related to her participation in the meetings of the Departmental Board and, in the past, as a Program Consultant (**I 44 No. 1-4**).

2. Social activity

Milena Karailieva is a member of the Bulgarian Chamber of Education, Science and Culture (BCESC)/(BKONK) and has been a Director of the Human Resources Management Program since 2011 (**G 23**).

3. Attracting students to the program

The applicant is a member of the Tourism Section of the Administration and Management Department. As such she takes an active part in the work of the department. She has participated in various teams for the improvement of the bachelor's and master's degree programs in tourism. In addition, as a Program Consultant from 2009 to 2018, she has been involved in organizing and conducting candidate-student campaigns.

V. Personal impressions of the applicant

My personal impressions of Milena Karailieva are very good. She is a former student of mine and a PhD student at the UWNE. As a student she was excellent at the course, and her doctoral work was distinguished by its originality and innovativeness. She impressed with her hard work, responsibility for the tasks assigned and precision in their execution. In her teaching activities, she widely applies interactive training tools, and in research system-integrated and situational approaches.

She enjoys authority among students and colleagues. The feedback from the branch organizations in tourism are also good. She is fluent in written and spoken English and Russian, which helps her in teaching.

VI. Opinions, recommendations and notes on the applicant's activities and achievements.

Taking into account the tendencies and preferences of Milena Karailieva in her research work, I would recommend to her in the future to devote her efforts in the management of innovation in the field of tourism.

Conclusion

From the examination of the competition documents, I have found that no violations in the selection procedure for associate professor have been made. The requirements of Art. 24, para 1, 27 (4) item 2 of ZRABRB and of Art.53 (1) and (2) and 57 (2) item 1 and item 2 of the RBMP.

The acquaintance with the competition documents and the evaluation of Milena Karailieva's publications gives me the reason to draw the following conclusions:

1. In the competition she is **the only** candidate.
2. Has an educational and scientific degree "**Doctor**"
3. Occupies the academic position of **chief assistant** in the higher education institution which announced the competition.
4. She is provided with the necessary **auditorium and extra-academic** employment. Осигурена ѝ е необходимата **аудиторна и извънаудиторна заетост**.
5. She has **published textbooks** on her major subjects.
6. **Delivers lectures** in 6 courses at Bachelor's Degree Program and 2 courses at NBU Master's Degree Program.
7. Has provided **scientific guidance** to 36 students and has reviewed 92 diploma papers.
8. Apply to the completion with a sufficient amount of **non-doctoral dissertation scientific production**, including **24 works**, consisting of 6 monographs, 1 studio, 1 textbook and 16 reports with a total volume of **1583 pages**.
9. Out of the 24 scientific papers presented, **5 are in English**.
10. **12 citations** from other authors have been documented by the candidate.
11. In total, the evaluated publications contain **indisputable scientific and applied contributions** to supplement and further develop scientific knowledge in the field human capital in tourism.

My summary assessment according to the criteria and indicators for educational, research and other academic activities related to the competition shows that the Chief Assistant Dr. Milena Metodieva Karailieva meets the requirements of Art.24, paragraph 1, 27 (4) items 1 and 2 of ZRABRB and of Art. 53 (1) and (2) and 57 (2) item 2 of the RBMP, as well as of the Regulation for the development of the academic staff at the NBU for the occupying the academic position of "Associate Professor" in professional direction 3.9 „**Tourism**" (**Human capital in tourism**).

Reviewer:

(Prof. Dr. Manol Ribov, Phd)

25.02.2020